

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA
SOUTHERN DIVISION**

IN RE BLUE CROSS BLUE SHIELD ANTITRUST LITIGATION MDL 2406	: : Master File 2:13-cv-20000-RDP : : : : This document relates to : Subscriber Track cases
---	--

**MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY
APPROVAL OF PROPOSED CLASS SETTLEMENT**

COME NOW the Subscriber Class Representatives¹ (on behalf of themselves and the Settlement Classes) (“Subscriber Plaintiffs”) in the above-styled action and hereby move this Court for an order preliminarily approving the proposed class settlement of the Subscriber Plaintiffs’ claims against the Settling Defendants, finding that the Settlement Classes are likely to be certified at final approval, preliminarily approving the Plan of Distribution, and setting a Final Approval Hearing. This Motion is also supported by the Self-Funded Sub-Class Representative.

Subscriber Plaintiffs seek preliminary approval of their proposed settlement Damages Class, including a Self-Funded Sub-Class, and Injunctive Relief Class. These proposed Settlement Classes and other terms of the Settlement Agreement were agreed upon after several years of arm’s-length negotiations with the assistance of three highly respected mediators, including Special Master Edgar C. Gentle.

The Settlement Agreement is fair, reasonable, adequate, and likely to warrant final approval under the Eleventh Circuit’s long-standing class settlement fairness factors as well as the requirements of Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(e)(2). Moreover, the proposed Settlement Classes satisfy and

¹ Capitalized terms not otherwise defined herein shall have the meaning given them in the attached Settlement Agreement.

are certifiable under Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(a), (b)(2) and (b)(3). Finally, the proposed Plan of Distribution of settlement proceeds should be preliminarily approved because it is fair, adequate and reasonable.

In support of this Motion, Subscriber Plaintiffs submit herewith the Subscriber Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion for Preliminary Approval of Proposed Class Settlement along with the Settlement Agreement as Exhibit A; proposed orders granting preliminary and final approval of the settlement as Exhibits B and C, respectively; the proposed Plan of Distribution as Exhibit D; the Joint Declaration of Settlement Class Counsel as Exhibit E; the Declaration of Self-Funded Sub-Class Settlement Counsel as Exhibit F; the Declaration of Kenneth R. Feinberg as Exhibit G; the Declaration of Darrell Chodorow as Exhibit H; the Declaration of Daniel Rubinfeld as Exhibit I; the Declaration of Ariel Pakes as Exhibit J; and the Declaration of Special Master Edgar C. Gentle as Exhibit K. This Motion is also support by Subscriber Plaintiffs' Motion for Approval of a Plan for Notice and Appointment of Claims Administrator, brief in support, and attached exhibits.

For these reasons, as well as those set forth in the supporting materials submitted herewith, Subscriber Plaintiffs' Motion should be granted, and the Court should enter a preliminary approval order in the form proposed.

Date: October 30, 2020

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ David Boies
David Boies – ***Co-Lead Counsel***
BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP
333 Main Street
Armonk, NY 10504
Tel: (914) 749-8200
Fax: (914) 749-8200
dboies@bsfllp.com

/s/ Michael D. Hausfeld
Michael D. Hausfeld – ***Co-Lead Counsel***
Swathi Bojedla – ***Discovery Committee***
HAUSFELD LLP
1700 K Street NW, Suite 650
Washington, DC 20006
Tel: (202) 540-7200
Fax: (202) 540-7201
mhausfeld@hausfeld.com
sbojedla@hausfeld.com

Charles J. Cooper – ***Co-Chair, Written Submissions Committee***
COOPER & KIRK, PLLC
1523 New Hampshire Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20036
Tel: (202) 220-9600
Fax: (202) 220-9601
ccooper@cooperkirk.com

Megan Jones – ***Settlement Committee & PSC Member***
Arthur Bailey – ***Discovery Committee***
HAUSFELD LLP
600 Montgomery Street, Suite 3200
San Francisco, CA 94111
Tel: (415) 633-1908
Fax: (415) 358-4980
mjones@hausfeld.com
abailey@hausfeld.com

Chris T. Hellums – ***Local Facilitating Counsel***
PITTMAN, DUTTON & HELLUMS, P.C.
2001 Park Place N, 1100 Park Place Tower
Birmingham, AL 35203
Tel: (205) 322-8880
Fax: (205) 328-2711
chrish@pittmandutton.com

William A. Isaacson – ***Settlement Committee & PSC Member***
PAUL WEISS
2001 K Street, NW
Washington, DC 20006-1047
Tel: (202) 223-7313
Fax: (202) 379-4937
wisaacson@paulweiss.com

Gregory Davis – ***Settlement Committee & PSC Member***
DAVIS & TALIAFERRO, LLC
7031 Halcyon Park Drive
Montgomery, AL 36117
Tel: (334) 832-9080
Fax: (334) 409-7001
gldavis@knology.net

Cyril V. Smith – ***Settlement Committee & PSC Member***
ZUCKERMAN SPAEDER, LLP
100 East Pratt Street, Suite 2440
Baltimore, MD 21202-1031
Tel: (410) 949-1145
Fax: (410) 659-0436
csmith@zuckerman.com

Kathleen Chavez – ***Settlement Committee & PSC Member***

FOOTE, MIELKE, CHAVEZ & O'NEIL, LLC
10 West State Street, Suite 200
Geneva, IL 60134
Tel: (630) 797-3339
Fax: (630) 232-7452
kcc@fmcolaw.com

Carl S. Kravitz – ***Expert Committee***

ZUCKERMAN SPAEDER LLP
1800 M Street NW, Suite 1000
Washington, DC 20036-5807
Tel: (202) 778-1800
Fax: (202) 822-8106
ckravitz@zuckerman.com

Mindee Reuben
Lite DePalma Greenberg
1835 Market Street, Suite 2700
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Tel: (267) 314-7980
Fax: (973) 623-0858
mreubin@litedepalma.com

Patrick Cafferty – ***Discovery Committee***
CAFFERTY CLOBES MERIWETHER &
SPRENGEL LLP

150 S. Wacker Drive, Suite 300
Chicago, IL 60606
Tel: (312) 782-4880
pcafferty@caffertyclobes.com

David Guin – ***Co-Chair, Written Submissions Committee***

Tammy Stokes – ***Damages Committee***
GUIN, STOKES & EVANS, LLC
300 Richard Arrington Jr. Blvd. North
Suite 600/Title Building
Birmingham, AL 35203
Tel: (205) 226-2282
Fax: (205) 226-2357
davidg@gseattorneys.com
tammys@gseattorneys.com

Richard Feinstein – ***Expert Committee***

Karen Dyer – ***Expert Committee***
Hamish P.M. Hume – ***Discovery Committee***
BOIES, SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP
1401 New York Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20005
Tel: (202) 237-2727
Fax: (202) 237-6131
rfeinstein@bsfllp.com
kdyer@bsfllp.com
hhume@bsfllp.com

Nate Cihlar
Joshua Callister
Strauss & Boies
4041 University Drive, 5th Floor
Fairfax, VA 22030
Tel: (703) 764-8700
Fax: (703) 764-8704
ncihlar@strauss-boies.com
jcallister@strauss-boies.com

Bryan Clobes – ***Litigation Committee***
Ellen Meriwether – ***Written Submissions Committee***

CAFFERTY CLOBES MERIWETHER &
SPRENGEL LLP
2005 North Monroe Street
Media, PA 19063
Tel: (215) 864-2800
Fax: (215) 864-2810
bclobes@caffertyclobes.com
meriwether@caffertyclobes.com

Andrew Lemmon – Chair, Discovery
Committee

LEMMON LAW FIRM

15058 River Road

PO Box 904

Hahnville, LA 70057

Tel: (985) 783-6789

Fax: (985) 783-1333

andrew@lemmonlawfirm.com

Virginia Buchanan – Chair, Class Certification
Committee

LEVIN PAPANTONIO THOMAS

MITCHELL RAFFERTY & PROCTOR, P.A.

316 South Baylen Street, Suite 600

Pensacola, FL 32502

Tel: (850) 435-7000

Fax: (850) 435-7020

vbuchanan@levinlaw.com

Douglas Dellaccio – *Litigation Committee*
CORY WATSON CROWDER & DEGARIS,
P.C.

2131 Magnolia Avenue, Suite 200

Birmingham, AL 32505

Tel: (205) 328-2200

Fax: (205) 324-7896

ddellaccio@cwcd.com

Larry McDevitt – *Chair, Class Certification
Committee*

David Wilkerson – *Discovery Committee*

VAN WINKLE LAW FIRM

11 North Market Street

Asheville, NC 28801

Tel: (828) 258-2991

lmcdevitt@vwlawfirm.com

dwilkerson@vwlawfirm.com

Edwin J. Kilpela, Jr.

Benjamin Sweet – *Litigation Committee*

DEL SOLE CAVANAUGH STROYD LLC

200 First Avenue, Suite 300

Pittsburgh, PA 15222

Tel: (412) 261-2393

Fax: (412) 261-2110

ekilpela@dsclaw.com

bsweet@dsclaw.com

Robert M. Foote – *Damages Committee*
FOOTE, MIELKE, CHAVEZ & O'NEIL,
LLC

10 West State Street, Suite 200

Geneva, IL 60134

Tel: (630) 797-3339

Fax: (630) 232-7452

rmf@fmcolaw.com

Charles T. Caliendo – *Class Certification
Committee*

GRANT & EISENHOFER

485 Lexington Avenue

New York, NY 10017

Tel: (646) 722-8500

Fax: (646) 722-8501

ccaliendo@gelaw.com

Robert Eisler – *Discovery Committee*
GRANT & EISENHOFER

123 Justison Street

Wilmington, DE 19801

Tel: (302) 622-7000

Fax: (302) 622-7100

reisler@gelaw.com

Daniel Gustafson – ***Litigation Committee***
Daniel C. Hedlund – ***Damages Committee***
GUSTAFSON GLUEK PLLC
120 South Sixth Street, Suite 2600
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Tel: (612) 333-8844
Fax: (612) 339-6622
dgustafson@gustafsongluek.com
dhedlund@gustafsongluek.com

Brent Hazzard – ***Litigation Committee***
HAZZARD LAW, LLC
447 Northpark Drive
Ridgeland, MS 39157
Tel: (601) 977-5253
Fax: (601) 977-5236
brenthazzard@yahoo.com

John Saxon – ***Litigation Committee***
JOHN D. SAXON, P.C.
2119 3rd Avenue North
Birmingham, AL 35203-3314
Tel: (205) 324-0223
Fax: (205) 323-1583
jsaxon@saxonattorneys.com

Lawrence Jones – ***Damages Committee***
JONES WARD PLC
The Pointe
1205 East Washington Street, Suite 111
Louisville, Kentucky 40206
Tel: (502) 882-6000
Fax: (502) 587-2007
larry@jonesward.com

Robert Methvin – ***Chair, Settlement Committee***
James M. Terrell – ***Class Certification Committee***
MCCALLUM, METHVIN & TERRELL, P.C.
The Highland Building
2201 Arlington Avenue South
Birmingham, AL 35205
Tel: (205) 939-0199
Fax: (205) 939-0399
rgm@mmlaw.net
jterrell@mmlaw.net

Michael McGartland – ***Class Certification Committee***
MCGARTLAND & BORCHARDT LLP
1300 South University Drive, Suite 500
Fort Worth, TX 76107
Tel: (817) 332-9300
Fax: (817) 332-9301
mike@attorneysmb.com

H. Lewis Gillis – ***Co-Head Chair, Litigation Committee***
MEANS GILLIS LAW, LLC
3121 Zelda Court
Montgomery, AL 36106
Tel: 1-800-626-9684
hlgillis@tmgslaw.com

David J. Hodge – ***Chair, Settlement Committee***
MORRIS, KING & HODGE
200 Pratt Avenue NE
Huntsville, AL 35801
Tel: (256) 536-0588
Fax: (256) 533-1504
lstewart@alinjurylaw.com

Counsel for Subscriber Plaintiffs

/s/ Warren T. Burns

Warren T. Burns
BURNS CHAREST LLP
900 Jackson Street, Suite 500
Dallas, Texas 75202
Tel: (469) 904-4550
Fax: (469) 444-5002
wburns@burnscharest.com

Counsel for the Self-Funded Sub-Class

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on October 30, 2020, the foregoing Subscriber Plaintiffs' Motion for Preliminary Approval of Proposed Class Settlement was filed with the Clerk of the Court and served on counsel of record via ECF.

/s/ Michael D. Hausfeld
Michael D. Hausfeld